

**Construction Sector Transparency Initiative – Ethiopia (CoST – Ethiopia)**

**Assurance Report on Reactive Disclosure of Project and Contract Information**

**For**

**Tikur Anbesa Hospital Emergency Medicine Unit Building Project**

MARCH, 2019

ADDIS ABABA, ETHIOPIA

**Table of Contents**

[LIST OF ACRONYMS 3](#_Toc11658996)

[I. BACKGROUND 4](#_Toc11658997)

[II. SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND CAUSES OF CONCERN 5](#_Toc11658998)

[1. INTRODUCTION 7](#_Toc11658999)

[1.1 Objective of the Assurance Process 7](#_Toc11659000)

[1.2 Activities of the Assurance Process 7](#_Toc11659001)

[1.3 Challenges of the Assurance Process 8](#_Toc11659002)

[2. DISCLOSURE OF PROJECT INFORMATION 9](#_Toc11659003)

[2.1 Project Overview 9](#_Toc11659004)

[2.2 Scope of the Project 9](#_Toc11659005)

[2.3 Socio Economic Benefits (Purpose) of the Project 9](#_Toc11659006)

[2.4 Source of Funding and Project Cost 9](#_Toc11659007)

[2.5 Project Duration 9](#_Toc11659008)

[3. DISCLOSURE OF PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT INFORMATION FOR DESIGN, CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION AND SUPERVISION SERVICES 10](#_Toc11659009)

[3.1 Disclosure of Procurement Information 10](#_Toc11659010)

[**3.1.1** **Overview of the Procurement Process** 10](#_Toc11659011)

[**3.1.2** **Verification of the Disclosed Procurement Information** 10](#_Toc11659012)

[**3.1.3** **Analysis of the Disclosed Procurement Information** 10](#_Toc11659013)

[3.2 Disclosure of the consultancy Contract Information 11](#_Toc11659014)

[4. DISCLOSURE OF PROCUREMENT & CONTRACT INFORMATION FOR WORKS CONTRACT 12](#_Toc11659015)

[4.1 Disclosure of Procurement Information 12](#_Toc11659016)

[**4.1.1** **Overview of the Procurement Process** 12](#_Toc11659017)

[**4.1.2** **Verification of the Procurement Information** 13](#_Toc11659018)

[**4.1.3** **Analysis of the Disclosed Procurement Information** 13](#_Toc11659019)

[4.2 Disclosure of Contract Information 16](#_Toc11659020)

[**4.2.1** **Overview of the Contract** 16](#_Toc11659021)

[**4.2.2** **Verification of the Disclosed Contract Information** 17](#_Toc11659022)

[**4.2.3** **Analysis of the Disclosed Contract Information** 17](#_Toc11659023)

[5. Project and Contract Information Disclosure Template 19](#_Toc11659024)

# LIST OF ACRONYMS

AAU Addis Ababa University

AP Assurance Professional

CoST Construction Sector Transparency Initiative

DNA Document not Available

EIA Environmental Impact Assessment

EOI Expression of Interest

ETB Ethiopian Birr

FDRE Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

ICB International Competitive Bidding

IPC Interim Payment Certificate

LCBS Least Cost Based System

IDS Infrastructure Data Standardn

NA Not Applicable

NCB National Competitive Bidding

NMSG National Multi Stakeholder Group

No Number

PE Procuring Entity (AAU)

FPPA Federal Public Procurement and Property Administration Agency

QCBS Quality and Cost Based System

TAC Technical Analysis Committee

VO Variation Order

# BACKGROUND

Construction Sector Transparency (CoST) Initiative is a multi-stakeholder Initiative working for better lives from better infrastructure using disclosure of project information and social accountability as a tool. Purpose of the assurance process is to validate the information disclosed by procuring entities and interpret it in plain language that helps stakeholders understand the main issues.

This assurance report is prepared for Tikur Anbesa Hospital Emergency Medicine Unit Building Project. The assurance process, as per the CoST program, is designed to have the dual function of first giving assurance that the information disclosed by PEs is accurate and complete, and second of interpreting the disclosed information in plain language to highlight *issues of concern*. Such process enhances accountability and improves efficiency and effectiveness in the delivery of infrastructure.

This assurance report is prepared based on project and contract information collected by the assurance professional himself. A Brief Description of the Project & Contracts included in this report are summarized, hereunder, in Table 1.1.

**TABLE 1.1: SUMMARY OF PROJECT AND CONTRACT INFORMATION**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Date of Disclosure and Assurance | September, 2018 |
| Name of the Project | Emergency Medicine Unit Building |
| Project Location | Addis Ababa, Tikur Anbesa Hospital |
| Name of the Employer (PE) | Addis Ababa University |
| List of Contracts | * Design, Contract Administration and Supervision Contract * Works Contract |
| Contractor | Teklebrehan Ambaye Construction PLC |
| Consultant | Bereket Tesfaye Consulting Architects and Engineers |

# SUMMARY OF FINDINGS AND CAUSES OF CONCERN

1. **UNAVAILABILITY OF SUFFICIENT PROJECT INFORMATION**

Lack of proper maintenance and smooth access to documents is one of the main problem faced during the assurance process. The information in relation to: procurement of Consultancy Service, changes to the respective Original Contracts of Consultancy Service; and initial project programs could not be availed by the PE. There are also other important lists of information, as described at the end of the introduction section, that are necessary but could not be traced. The lack of complete project information has resulted in:

* difficulty to make more informed judgment;
* Information gap to assess PE’s transparency on the Procurements and Contract management process of the consultancy service contract.

1. **LOW NUMBER OF INTERESTED BIDDERS FOR THE WORKS CONTRACT**

It has been observed that a lesser number of bidders have submitted their qualification applications than expected as compared to the number of bidders who bought the Bid Documents. Out of twenty-five (25) prospective bidders who bought the tender documents for Works Contract, only five (5) have submitted their qualification applications and financial offers. Hence 80% of the interested bidders have declined to submit their proposals.

1. **INEFFICIENCY OF PROCUREMENT PROCESS (TIMELINESS)**

Despite the fact that only five bidders have submitted their application, the procurement process for Works Contract has taken about 227 calendar days. A major delay was seen on the process of financial evaluation which took 107 calendar days. The second major delay was seen on the technical evaluation which required 73 calendar days.

It was only one bidder, out of the five who submitted proposal, who passes the technical qualification. Hence the financial proposal was opened only for one bidder., The 107 calendar days spend to evaluate financial proposal only for one bidder demonstrates the inefficiency of the PE’s procurement process.

1. **NON COMPLIANCE TO THE PERMITTED PROCUREMENT METHOD**

The type of Procurement method advertised for Works was National Competitive Bidding (NCB), which is not in compliance with the regulatory requirement that obliges International Competitive Bidding (ICB) procurement method as the project cost is above 50 million Birr.

1. **ISSUES ON CHANGES TO CONTRACT PRICE**

It is observed that the works Contract has faced significant amount (67.4%) of Variation Works. Until August, 2018, 25% of Variation Works are approved and issued and the remaining 42.4% is waiting for approval, for the reason that the PE should get permission of the FPPA for variation works that exceed 25% of the contract amount. The main reasons for the variations was relocation of construction site and design change which are caused by inadequate preparation works.

1. **ISSUES ON CHANGES TO CONTRACT DURATION**

It is observed that the original duration, 365 calendar days, of the works Contract has been extended by 605 calendar days. The basic reasons are design change, relocation of construction site and delay on getting construction permit.

1. **MAJOR CHANGES TO CONTRACT SCOPE**

It is observed that a major change has been made on the original design as per the order of the PE to increase the number of Patient bed rooms by more than twice of the original requirement. There is no clear information as to why the PE has made such major design changes after entering into a contract for construction.

# [INTRODUCTION](#_Toc399112304)

This assurance report is prepared following the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) signed between CoST Ethiopia and Addis Ababa University that required Reactive Disclosure of Project & Contract Information for Tikur Anbesa Hospital Emergency Medicine Unit Building Project.

## Objective of the Assurance Process

The main objective of the assurance process is to analyze Project and Contract information of the project for its compliance to the requirements of the applicable laws.

## Activities of the Assurance Process

* Collecting project and contract information from the PE and, where necessary, consultant and contractor
* Verifying the accuracy and completeness of information.
* Analysing the information obtained in order enable the public to make informed judgements about the cost, time of delivery , quality of the built infrastructure, and the procurement process.
* Producing reports that are clearly intelligible to the non-specialist, highlighting the main findings and cause for concern.
* Making presentations to NMSG-EC, multi-stakeholder forums, get feedbacks and refine the report accordingly.

## Challenges of the Assurance Process

The main challenge faced on carrying out the assurance process was the difficulty to access all the required project and contract information from PE’s office. Following is list of unavailable documents.

1. Feasibility Study,
2. Financing Agreements (Funding sources) for the Project,
3. Project budget approval date,
4. Project start date (planned, actual),
5. Planned/ Original duration for completing the whole project,
6. Planned/Original cost of the project,
7. Bid Documents,
8. Tender Evaluation Reports for Design and Supervision Contract,
9. Content of any complaint lodged during procurement process of works,
10. Letter of Awards,
11. Complete Contract Document for Design and Supervision Contract,
12. Claims requested and approved,
13. Changes to Contracts (Price, Duration, Scope) for Design and Supervision Contract,
14. Interim and/or final Payment Certificates for Design and Supervision Contract,
15. Safety Measures (accident & death),
16. Minutes of Meetings, Letter Correspondences, etc.,
17. Costs of Contracts at Completion.

# [DISCLOSURE OF PROJECT INFORMATION](#_Toc399112306)

## [Project Overview](#_Toc399112307)

Addis Ababa University, the PE, has signed a Contract with Bereket Tesfaye Consulting Architects and Engineers, on November 18/ 2013, to carry out consultancy service of design of the B + Sub B + G+7 Building, Emergency Medicine Unit Building project, along with supervision and contract administration tasks during the construction phase. The PE has made invitation to all eligible and qualified local contractors of category BC/GC-1 using Ethiopian Herald newspaper on July 10, 2014. Following the submission of qualification and financial proposals by the bidders, the PE has given the necessary approvals based on the evaluated results of technical and financial proposals of the bidders carried out by the assigned consultant. Finally, the PE has signed a contract with Teklebrehan Ambaye Construction PLC, on April 02/ 2015, to carry out the construction within 365 calendar days. The construction was started on April 29, 2015. However, progress of the construction project was 53.77% until August 30, 2018. Currently, the project is under construction.

## [Scope of the Project](#_Toc399112308)

The scope of the project comprises design and construction of **B + Sub B + G+7 Building**, planned to meet the need in emergency medicine unit of Tikur Anbesa Hospital.

## [Socio Economic Benefits (Purpose) of the Project](#_Toc399112309)

The project is expected to improve the emergency health medication facility for the society.

## [Source of Funding and Project Cost](#_Toc399112311)

There is no information from PE’s office concerning the source of funding and total cost of the project. However, the contract amounts for the consultancy services and construction works are ETB 1,899,225.00 (including VAT) and ETB 220,221,117.92 (including VAT), respectively.

## Project Duration

The estimated duration of the overall project was not clearly known due to absence of relevant document. However, the duration to carry out the construction is 365 calendar days.

# [DISCLOSURE OF PROCUREMENT AND CONTRACT INFORMATION](#_Toc399112312) FOR DESIGN, CONTRACT ADMINISTRATION AND SUPERVISION SERVICES

## Disclosure of Procurement Information

The procurement process of the consultancy service is not discussed in this report due to lack of access to Tender Evaluation Report.

### [**Overview of the Procurement Process**](#_Toc399112314)

The procuring entity didn’t provide sufficient information on the procurement process of the Consultancy Service. The only document made available from the PE office is the final result of the procurement which is signed and sealed contract agreement document for the consultancy service. It is indicated that the PE has made Contract with Bereket Tesfaye Consulting Architects and Engineers to carry out consultancy service of design, supervision and contract administration, on November 18/ 2013.

### **Verification of the Disclosed Procurement Information**

#### **Completeness of the Disclosed Procurement Information**

With the available documents from the PE, it was possible to compile only fourteen (14) out of thirty (30) items of information required by the Standard Disclosure Template of CoST – Ethiopia.

#### **Accuracy of the Disclosed Procurement Information**

The signed contract document for the consultancy service available from PE are directly copied from its original source.

### **Analysis of the Disclosed Procurement Information**

Due to lack of the required information, as described above, this report couldn’t review the PE’s performance on the procurement process of consultancy service against the following critical points:

* Compliance of the Procurement Process with Rules of Advertisement;
* Efficiency of the Procurement Process (Timeliness);
* Fairness of the Procurement Rules On Participation;
* Transparency of the Tender Evaluation Process;
* Objectivity the Tender Evaluation and the Award Criteria; and
* Competitiveness of the Award Price.

## [Disclosure of the consultancy Contract Information](#_Toc399112312)

#### **Overview of** [**the Contract**](#_Toc399112315)

The total contract price agreed to carry out the design, construction supervision and contract administration services is ETB 1,899,225.00, including VAT. The design fee is agreed as lump sum amounting to ETB 270,000.00 excluding VAT and including 117,500.00 ETB Reimbursable amount before VAT as. On the other hand, the contract price for supervision and contract administration is agreed on monthly basis amounting to ETB 35,000.00/month before VAT. The service for design contract has already been completed. However, the construction supervision and contract administration is currently going on along with the construction works contract.

#### **Verification of the Disclosed Contract Information**

#### **Completeness of the Disclosed Contract Information**

The employer has provided some of the documents in relation to the consultancy service. Based on the provided documents it was possible to gather only 7 items of information out of the 14 items required to be completed in the standard Disclosure Template of CoST – Ethiopia.

#### **Accuracy of the Disclosed Contract Information**

Most of the available documents provided from PE’s office are directly copied from its original source documents. However, the information with respect to Safety Measures (accident & death), Disputed issues & Award details and Quality of works are taken from the letter issued by the procuring entity.

# [DISCLOSURE OF PROCUREMENT & CONTRACT INFORMATION](#_Toc399112312) FOR WORKS CONTRACT

## Disclosure of Procurement Information

### [**Overview of the Procurement Process**](#_Toc399112314)

The invitation for the bid was published on the Ethiopian Herald on July 10, 2014. The deadline for submission of the bid was originally set on August 08, 2014 at 10.00 AM. However, the bid closing and opening date was changed to August 18, 2014 at 10.00 AM and opening at 10.30 AM by the PE.

Pursuant to the notice of invitation, twenty-five applicants have collected the tender documents before the deadline for submission of applications. Among the twenty-five bidders who have bought the tender documents, only five (5) (see Table 5.1 below) have submitted their qualification applications and financial offers in separate sealed envelopes before/on August 18, 2014, 10:00 AM.

**Table 4.1: List of Applicants who submitted their applications for post qualifications and financial Bids**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Item No.** | **Applicants** | **Country of Registration** |
| 1 | Flint stone Engineering | Ethiopia |
| 2 | YOTEK Construction PLC | Ethiopia |
| 3 | Teklebrehan Ambaye Construction PLC | Ethiopia |
| 4 | Zamra Construction PLC | Ethiopia |
| 5 | Afro Tsion Construction PLC | Ethiopia |

The evaluation was carried out in two stage procedures, namely, Technical and Financial Bid Evaluation. The technical evaluation process has been carried out by an external Consultant, Bereket Tesfaye Consulting Architects and Engineers. The consultant has submitted its recommendation for approval to the PE’s office on Nov 17/2014. As per the result of the evaluation, only one bidder, Teklebrehan Ambaye Construction PLC, passed the technical evaluation.

The consultant’s recommendation has been reviewed by Procurement Evaluation and Approval Committee of the PE and finally approved on 16/03/07 E.C to open the financial offer. Accordingly, the PE has opened the financial offer of Teklebrehan Ambaye Construction PLC on Nov 27/2014. The evaluation process has also been carried out by the same external Consultant. The consultant has evaluated the financial offer and submitted its recommendation to the PE on March 13, 2015. As a result of the evaluation, Teklebrehan Ambaye Construction PLC became the winner of the bid with a contract price of 220,221,117.92 Birr (including VAT).

The amount of bidder’s offer is 11.8% higher than engineer’s estimate (which is ETB 196,898,414.42), which has been updated by considering the market price during the time of evaluation; and the consultant has advised the procuring entity that the bidder’s offer is in acceptable range. The consultant’s recommendation has been reviewed by Procurement Evaluation and Approval Committee of the PE and finally got approval on 14/07/2007. The PE has signed Contract with Teklebrehan Ambaye Construction PLC on April 02, 2015.

### **Verification of the Procurement Information**

#### **Completeness of the Collected Procurement Information**

The PE has availed the tender evaluation reports of the bidders’ technical and financial proposals. From the document, it was possible to extract, 25 items of information out of 30, required by the Standard Disclosure Template of CoST – Ethiopia.

### **Analysis of the Disclosed Procurement Information**

#### **Compliance of the Procurement Process with Rules of Advertisement**

**Media of Bid Advertisement:** The Bid was openly advertised on the Ethiopian Herald which is widely known newspaper in Ethiopia. The Media used for Bid Advertisement has complied with Article 16.2/1 of the Federal Public Procurement Directive (2010).

**Bid Floating Period:** The date of procurement notice of the bid was July 10, 2014 and the deadline for bid submission was August 18, 2014. Hence floating period of the Bid was 40 calendar days. In accordance with Article 16.9/2 of the Federal Public Procurement Directive (2010) the minimum bid period shall be 30 days for National Competitive Bid. Therefore, floating Period of the Bid complies with rules of the Procurement Directive (2010).

#### **Efficiency of the Procurement Process (Timeliness)**

The PE has opened the bid on August 18, 2014. After carrying out the necessary evaluations and approvals on submittals of technical and financial proposals, the PE has signed Contract with the winner on April 02, 2015. From this, it is possible to see that the period to finalize the procurement process has taken about seven and half months.

In the absence of information of Bid Validity Period of the bid, it is difficult to judge whether or not the PE has carried out the procurement process efficiently. However, as a general practice of the industry and also the limit of Bid Validity Period fixed by public procurement rules, the time taken for carrying out procurement process is too long and unreasonable. The durations required by the different stages of the procurement process are summarized in Table 5.3:

**Table 4.2: Summary of Procurement Process and Period of Performance for Works Contract**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Item No.** | **Description of Procurement Process** | **Start Date** | **Completion Date** | **Period (Cal. Days)** |
| 1 | Opening date of the bid | Aug. 18, 2014 | Aug. 18, 2014 | 1 |
| 2 | Time taken by PE to forward Bidders’ Document to Consultant for Bid Evaluation | Aug. 19, 2014 | Sep. 4, 2014 | 17 |
| 3 | Technical Evaluation by Consultant | Sep. 5, 2014 | Nov. 17/2014 | 73 |
| 4 | Review on Submittals of Consultant’s Technical Evaluation Document by AAU Procurement Evaluation Committee | Nov. 18/2014 | 10/03/07  Nov. 19/2014 | 2 |
| 5 | Approval of Technical Evaluation by AAU Procurement Approval Committee | 11/03/07  Nov. 20/2014 | 16/03/07  Nov. 25/2014 | 6 |
| **Item No.** | **Description of Procurement Process** | **Start Date** | **Completion Date** | **Period (Cal. Days)** |
| 6 | Period until Opening date of Financial offer | Nov. 26/2014 | Nov. 26/2014 | 1 |
| 7 | Opening date of Financial offer | Nov 27/2014 | Nov 27/2014 | 1 |
| 8 | Period of Financial Evaluation process until submittal date of Consultant to PE for approval | Nov. 27/2014 | Mar. 13/2015 | 107 |
| 9 | Review on Submittals of Consultant’s Financial Evaluation Document by AAU Procurement Evaluation Committee | Mar. 14/2015 | 07/07/07  Mar. 16/2015 | 3 |
| 10 | Approval of Financial Evaluation by AAU Procurement Approval Committee | 08/07/07  Mar. 17/2015 | 14/07/07  Mar. 23/2015 | 7 |
| 11 | Period until Contract signing date | Mar. 24/2015 | April 01, 2015 | 9 |
| 12 | Contract signing date | April 02, 2015 |  |  |
|  | **Total Period** | | | **227** |

Considering the fact that only one bidder, out of the five who submitted proposal, has passed the technical qualification, the 107 calendar days spend to evaluate financial proposal of only one bidder is too long that demonstrate inefficiency of the PE’s procurement process

#### **LOW NUMBER OF INTERESTED BIDDERS**

It has been observed that a lesser number of bidders have submitted their qualification applications than expected as compared to the number of bidders who bought the Bid Documents. Out of twenty-five (25) prospective bidders who bought the tender documents for Works Contract, only five (5) of them have submitted their qualification applications and financial offers. Hence 80% of the interested bidders have declined to submit their proposals.

#### **Transparency of the Tender Evaluation Process**

The following transparency elements of the tender process has been carried out:

* + - Clarification and amendments have been shared for all bidders equally.
    - Pre proposal meeting have been conducted to provide clarification for any quires from bidders.
    - There was public opening of proposals in the presence of Bidders and/ or their representatives.
    - The opening was made immediately after the deadline for submission of tenders.
    - There was external Consultant assigned specific to this procurement and its output is evaluated by the Procurement Evaluation Committee which is also subjected to approval of the Procurement Approval Committee.
    - Records of proceedings for bid openings are retained and available for review.

#### **Overview of Contract Milestones: Original Scope, Time and Cost**

The scope of the project comprises design and construction of B + Sub B + G+7 Building, which is intended to meet the need in emergency medicine unit for Tikur Anbesa Hospital. The PE has signed a contract with Teklebrehan Ambaye Construction PLC to construct Tikur Anbesa Hospital Emergency Building Unit with an amount of 220,221,117.92 Birr (including VAT) to be completed within 365 calendar days.

## [Disclosure of Contract Information](#_Toc399112312)

### **Overview of** [**the Contract**](#_Toc399112315)

Signing of the Contract was made on April 02, 2015. The original agreed Contract Amount was ETB 220,221,117.92 (including VAT) and intended to be completed within 365 calendar days. The construction was started on April 29, 2015. However, progress of construction works was 53.77% until August 30, 2018. Currently, the project is under construction.

### **Verification of the Disclosed Contract Information**

#### **Completeness of the Disclosed Contract Information**

All the information required by the Disclosure format of CoST - Ethiopia has been availed by the PE

#### **Accuracy of the Disclosed Contract Information**

All the Contract Information disclosed on CoST Ethiopia Disclosure Template is referred, majorly from monthly Progress Report, which is submitted to PE by the assigned Consultant.

### **Analysis of the Disclosed Contract Information**

#### **Issues Related to Contract Price**

The original contract amount of Works Contract agreed on April 02, 2015 was ETB 220,221,117.92 (including VAT). However, the two parties have made an amendment to the original contract amount on Aug. 17, 2017 due to the change of quantity of valves from 270 to 20 pieces. The amended contract amount is ETB 204,793,068.87 (including VAT). Due to such amendment the original contract amount has decreased by an amount of ETB 15,428,049.05 (including VAT).

Moreover, a number of Variation Orders having significant price change on the Contract were issued. In reference with available information, a total amount of ETB 44,436,725.03 (excluding VAT) Variation Orders have been issued until February 30, 2019.

The Revised Contract Amount until August, 2018:

Amended Contract Amount = ETB 178,080,928.73

Variations Amount = ETB 44,436,725.03

Revised Contract Amount = **ETB 222,517,653.76** (excluding VAT)

Revised Contract Amount = **ETB 255,895,301.82** (including VAT).

The amount of the above Variation Order is 25% of contract amount and hence its approval is within the mandate of the PE. There are also additional variation works not yet issued waiting to get approval from concerned bodies. The remaining variation works are estimated to be **42.4**% of contract price and are very essential to make the building complete for use.

Main Reasons of the Variation Orders

1. Relocation of Construction Site: The construction site of the building is relocated to an area which required a huge amount of hard rock and ordinary soil excavation and construction of masonry retaining wall.
2. Major Design Change: The design is changed to double the number of Patient bed rooms. The change has resulted in increase on work items, mainly on installation of electrical, mechanical and sanitary fixtures.

#### **Issues Related to Contract Duration**

The Works Contract was originally intended to be completed within 365 Calendar days. The construction work for the Contract was started on April 29, 2015 and intended to be completed on April 29, 2015. Due to occurrence of several causes, a change has been made to Contract Duration at different time resulting to a total time extension of 605 Calendar days and the completion date has been extended to November 26, 2017.

Main Reasons on Changes to Contract Duration:

1. Relocation and Construction Permit – 168 Cal. Days;
2. Design Change – 409 Cal. Days;
3. Rainfall - 28 Cal. Days

#### **Issues Related to Contract Scope**

In the consultant letter Ref. no. በተ/336/09 dated 30/02/2009, forwarded to PE, it is stated that a major change has been made on the original design as per the order of the PE to increase the number of patient bed rooms by more than twice of the original requirement. The PE’s decision to increase the number of patient bed rooms has resulted with a significant change of time, cost and scope.

# Project and Contract Information Disclosure Template

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **DISCLOSURE OF PROCUREMENT & CONTRCT INFORMATION (44 ITEMS)** | | | | |
| **PHASE** | **ITEMS OF DISCLOSURE** | **CONSTRUCTION** | **DESIGN** | **SUPERVISION** |
| **PROCUREMENT INFORMATION (30 ITEMS)** | Date of disclosure | MARCH 2019 | | |
| Contract title | Tikur Anbesa Hospital Emergency Medicine Unit Building | Preparation of Building Design, Construction Supervision and Contract Administration Services of a seven story with basement floor Emergency Medicine unit building at Tikur Anbesa hospital | |
| Location | Addis Ababa | | |
| Procuring entity | Addis Ababa University | | |
| Source for further information | Procurement and Property Administration Directorate Office, Addis Ababa University; P. O. Box 1176; Telephone +251-11-23 97 81/ 23 40 59 | | |
| Date of procurement notice | July 10, 2014 | DNA | |
| Floating period of the procurement notice | 40 Cal. days | DNA | |
| Media used for procurement notice | Ethiopian Herald | DNA | |
| Method of procurement | Open bidding | DNA | |
| Type of Procurement | NCB | DNA | |
| Procurement procedure | Two stage bidding | DNA | |
| Evaluation criteria | LCBS | DNA | |
| Type of contract & project delivery method | Unit Price  Design-Bid-Build | DNA | |
| Type & Amount of bid security | CPO/Bank Guarantee;  Bid security amount – 100,000 ETB | DNA | |
| Content of any complaint lodged | DNA | DNA | |
| Engineer’s estimate | ETB **196,898,414.42** including VAT | DNA | |
| Date of bid opening | August 18, 2014 | DNA | |
| Number of bidders: Participated, rejected and declined to submit | Participated: 5  Rejected: 4  Declined to Submit: 20 | DNA | |
| Awarded firm/contracting firm | Teklebrehan Ambaye Construction PLC | Bereket Tesfaye Consulting Architects and Engineers | |
| Date of contract award | DNA | 28/01/2006 | |
| Award price/Original Contract Price | ETB 220,221,117.92 including VAT | Design Fee ETB 274,000.00  Reimbursable ETB 117,000.00 excluding VAT | ETB 35,000.00/Month excluding VAT |
| Unit Contract price (price/km, price/sq. meter) | DNA |  |  |
| Contract security type and amount | Performance Bond; ETB 22,022,111,80 | Performance Bank Guarantee (Unconditional) – ETB 189,927.00 – furnished on October 28, 2013  Professional Indemnity (Insurance) ETB 644,000.00  **Which is furnished on 31/07/2017** | |
| Date of Contract Signing | April 02, 2015 | November 18, 2013 | |
| Contract scope |  |  |  |
| Description of contract & Contract components |  |  |  |
| Contract administration entity | Bereket Tesfaye Consulting Architects and Engineers | Addis Ababa University | |
| Contract Duration | 365 Cal. days | 120 days | 48 (36+12) Months |
| Contract Start Date | April 29, 2015 | November 18, 2013 | April 29, 2015 |
| Intended Completion Date | April 29, 2016 | March 18, 2013 | April 29, 2019 |
| **CONTRACT IMPLEMENTATION & COMPLETION (14 ITEMS)** | Contract Status (ongoing (% progress), terminated, completed) | Ongoing; 61.02% until February 30, 2019 | Completed | Ongoing |
| completion date (Revised) | November 27, 2017 | DNA |  |
| Changes to contract duration with Reason | Total - 605 Cal. Days;  Relocation and construction permit – 168 Cal. Days;  Design change – 409 Cal. Days;  Rainfall - 28 Cal. Days | DNA | DNA |
| Amount of Liquidated Damage if applied (Penalty for delay) | NA | DNA | NA |
| Contract price (Revised) | ETB 222,436,725.03 excluding VAT – August, 2018 report. | DNA | DNA |
| Changes to contract price with reason | ETB 44,436,725.03 excluding VAT  Huge amount of Hard rock excavation and masonry retaining wall construction due to relocation of construction site;  Major Design Change. | DNA | ETB 134,550.00 – Design Modification |
| Scope at completion | NA | DNA | NA |
| Changes to contract scope with reason | A major change has been made on the original design in order to increase the number of Patient bed rooms by more than twice of the original requirement. | DNA | DNA |
| Total payment effected | Payment Certified ETB 132,756,357.19 until February 30, 2019 | DNA | DNA |
| warranty type and description | Advance Payment Bank Guarantee – ETB 33,919,797.89 furnished on November 28, 2018 | NA | |
| Details of Termination if applied | NA | NA | NA |
| Safety Measures (accident & death) | No accident & death were reported | No accident & death were reported | No accident & death were reported |
| Quality of work | Good | Good | Good |
| Disputed issues & Award details | No dispute issue | No dispute issue | No dispute issue |
|  |  |  |  |  |

**Note:**

NA – Note Applicable

DNA – Documents not Available

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **DISCLOSURE OF PROJECT INFORMATION (26 ITEMS)** | | |
| **PRELIMINARY PROJECT INFORMATION (18 ITEMS)** | Date of disclosure |  |
| Project owner | Addis Ababa University |
| Project name | Tikur Anbesa Hospital Emergency Medicine Unit Building |
| Sector, subsector | Building |
| Source for further information | Procurement and Property Administration Directorate Office, Addis Ababa University; P. O. Box 1176; Telephone +251-11-23 97 81/ 23 40 59 |
| Project Location | Addis Ababa, Tikur Anbesa Hospital |
| Purpose |  |
| Project description | Preparation of Building Design, Construction Supervision and Contract Administration Services and Construction of a seven story with basement floor Emergency Medicine unit building at Tikur Anbesa hospital |
| Original Project Scope |  |
| Project Components |  |
| Environmental impact | DNA |
| land & settlement impact | DNA |
| Estimated budget of the project with breakdown of components | Design, Construction Supervision and Contract Administration Services contract = ETB 1,899,225.00 including VAT;  Construction Works Contract = ETB 220,221,117.92 including VAT. |
| Funding sources | DNA |
| Project budget approval date | DNA |
| Project start date (planned, actual) | DNA |
| Planned/ Original duration for completing the whole project | DNA |
| Planned/Original cost of the project | DNA |
| **PROJECT INFORMATION AT COMPLETION (8 ITEMS)** | Cost of the project at completion | NA |
| changes of project cost with reason | Works Contract - ETB 44,436,725.03 excluding VAT  Huge amount of Hard rock excavation and masonry retaining wall construction due to relocation of construction site;  Major Design Change. |
| Project completion date (Revised) | November 26, 2017 |
| Actual duration for completing the whole project | Works Contract - 365 Cal. Days |
| changes of project duration with reason | Works Contract - Total - 605 Cal. Days;  Relocation and construction permit – 168 Cal. Days;  Design change – 409 Cal. Days;  Rainfall - 28 Cal. Days |
| Project Scope at completion | NA |
| changes of project scope with reason | Works Contract - A major change has been made on the original design in order to increase the number of Patient bed rooms by more than twice of the original requirement. |
| Reference to documents for disclosure upon request (reactive disclosure) | Procurement and Property Administration Directorate Office, Addis Ababa University. |
|  |  |

**Note:**

NA – Note Applicable

DNA – Documents not Available